

# **Employment and integration in Europe:**

How businesses can hire refugee women and gain a talented workforce

Written by

ECONOMIST IMPACT ECONOMIST IMPACT

### **Economist Impact**

Economist Impact combines the rigour of a think-tank with the creativity of a media brand to engage a globally influential audience. We believe that evidence-based insights can open debate, broaden perspectives and catalyse progress.

The services offered by Economist Impact previously existed within The Economist Group as separate entities, including EIU Thought Leadership, EIU Public Policy, Economist Events, EBrandConnect and SignalNoise. Our track record spans 75 years across 205 countries. Along with creative storytelling, events expertise, design-thinking solutions and market-leading media products, we produce framework design, benchmarking, economic and social impact analysis, forecasting and scenario modelling, making Economist Impact's offering unique in the marketplace.

Visit <u>economistimpact.com</u> for more information.



### Tent Partnership for Refugees

With more and more refugees displaced for longer periods of time, businesses have a critical role to play in helping refugees integrate economically into their new host communities. The Tent Partnership for Refugees mobilises the global business community to improve the lives and livelihoods of more than 30 million refugees who have been forcibly displaced from their home countries.

Founded by Chobani's founder and CEO Hamdi Ulukaya in 2016, Tent is a network of over 200 major companies committed to including refugees. Tent believes that companies can most sustainably support refugees by leveraging their core business operations and engaging refugees as potential employees, entrepreneurs, and consumers. The full list of Tent members can be found <u>here</u>.

Find out more at tent.org

# Acknowledgements

### This report is written by Economist Impact, and sponsored by the Tent Partnership for Refugees.

Economist Impact conducted desk research and interviews with experts and executives to better understand refugee women as a workforce in Europe and identify the key barriers to employment typically faced in a host country. The report also presents the business case for companies to hire and integrate refugee women by analysing how this talented workforce can fill gaps in the labour market, increase innovation and productivity, and enhance diversity. Drawing from best practices of large companies in Europe, the report concludes with recommendations for business leaders on how to improve recruitment and workforce development programmes to promote the inclusion of refugee women. Economist Impact bears sole responsibility for the content of this report. The findings and views expressed herein do not necessarily reflect the views of the partners and experts.

The report was produced by a team of researchers, writers and editors, including:

Monica Ballesteros, project lead Edwin Saliba, project manager Apurva Kothari, project analyst Ngan Tran, project analyst Michael Paterra, project advisor Ran Xu, author Amanda Simms, copy editor We would also like to extend our thanks to the experts and executives interviewed as part of this research programme:

André Mendes, senior manager Future Talent Programs, adidas

**Derya Ural**, supply chain sustainability manager, H&M Group

**Ekin Uluisik**, sustainability manager, Yavuzçehre Tekstil

**Enaam Alhanach**, merchandising co-ordinator, Staples Sverige

**Erdogan Sekerci**, social development specialist, H&M Group

Fahira Mulamehic, employer programmes manager, Refugee Council

Franziska Hirschelmann, joint CEO, Jobs 4 Refugees

Hala Abdelwahab, director of development, The Andan Foundation

**Josefine Palmqvist**, project manager, Swedish Public Employment Service

Klas Bergström, head of trade marketing and category management, Barilla

**Lise Werle**, equality, diversity and inclusion leader, IKEA France

Mallin Tilberg, HR manager, Staples Sverige

Patrick Hoffman, head of social impact, The Human Safety Net

**Petra Ornstein**, researcher, Swedish Public Employment Service

Priya Burci, CEO, Powercoders Switzerland

Talita Ramos Erickson, chief diversity and inclusion officer, Barilla

Wilma Roozenboom, director, Refugee Talent Hub

### Contents

A FOREWORD FROM TENT PARTNERSHIP FOR REFUGEES	6
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	8
I. CONTEXT ON THE REFUGEE CRISIS IN EUROPE SINCE 2015	10
II.REFUGEE WOMEN EMPLOYMENT LAGGING BEHIND REFUGEE MEN, NATIVE-BORN WOMEN	14
III. EUROPE'S WORKER SHORTAGE: HOW REFUGEE WOMEN CAN HELP CLOSE THE GAP	18
IV. THE BUSINESS CASE FOR HIRING REFUGEE WOMEN	20
V. UNDERSTANDING THE LABOUR MARKET CHALLENGES FACING REFUGEE WOMEN	24
VI. NET POSITIVE: INVESTING IN REFUGEE WOMEN TALENT	34
VII. RECOMMENDATIONS	44
ANNEX I: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	53
ANNEX II: WORKS CITED	54

### Foreword

Gender inequality affects women and girls all over the world. From companies' boardrooms to classrooms and individual households, entrenched social norms about women and their place in society create a considerable disadvantage when it comes to employment.

Refugee women face a double disadvantage when it comes to finding work and advancing their careers. In addition to the obstacles all refugees face when being forced to flee their home countries and having to start over in a new country-including language barriers, limited access to crucial resources like transport, and a lack of professional and social networks-refugee women face the added burden of challenges related to gender inequality in the workplace. This includes less opportunity to be promoted at work, carrying an outsized share of caregiving and household responsibilities, or not being offered wages that are on par with men. Despite the many challenges that refugee women contend with, they represent an incredible source of talent, innovation and diversity for companies.

At the Tent Partnership for Refugees, our mission is to mobilise the global business community in support of refugees; we focus on promoting refugees' economic integration. To ensure refugee women are given the opportunity to succeed in the workplace, we are launching an initiative to support refugee women across Europe. Major companies in Europe are pledging to mentor refugee women in skills like CV writing, job interviews and networking to prepare them to enter the job market and advance in their careers.

We believe that businesses have a responsibility—and an opportunity—to close the employment gap for refugee women in Europe. It's the socially responsible thing to do, but it's also good for businesses and is a clear win for them. Specifically, as a result of Europe's ageing population, compounded by labour shortages off the back of the covid-19 recovery, the continent's economy is in need of new talent pools like never before. While businesses have much to gain by hiring refugee women, it is a course of action currently overlooked by the vast majority of companies, as it's wrongly perceived as risky and resource-intensive. As a result, refugee women are employed at woefully low rates compared with both refugee men and the nativeborn population. In seeking to better understand what's holding refugee women behind—and what companies can do to be more inclusive of this population— this comprehensive study was written by Economist Impact and sponsored by Tent to unpack the challenges refugee women face when seeking employment, while laying out clear, actionable solutions companies in Europe can implement to better include refugee women.

This report will help companies recognise the reality faced by refugee women, and how they can rethink their recruitment and hiring processes to level the playing field. In doing so, they will help refugee women contribute to Europe's communities and economies as integrated, productive members of their new communities. We would like to thank the Economist Impact team and all of the individuals at organisations and companies that contributed to this project. We appreciate your support and are excited to work together to make a meaningful difference in the lives of refugee women.



Sincerely,

### Scarlet Cronin Acting Executive Director The Tent Partnership for Refugees

### **Executive summary**

By 2030 about one in four people in Europe will be 65 years or older, mostly driven by a rising life expectancy and falling fertility rates. The working-age population across the continent is projected to shrink by 13.5 million people (4%) from 2018 to 2030, with Germany experiencing one of the steepest declines in Europe.

The covid-19 pandemic has exacerbated existing labour shortages as border restrictions limited internal EU labour migration. As the economy recovers and lockdowns ease, some workers are reluctant to return to work due to health concerns, leaving employers on the lookout for new talent. Structural shifts in the European economy, such as the transition to carbon neutrality and ongoing digital transformation, will further aggravate these shortages. Accordingly, businesses in Europe will directly feel the impact of this labour gap in their daily operations—including rising labour costs, higher turnover rates and the length of time it takes to fill open positions, all of which could potentially hamper growth.

To counteract these labour shortages, businesses should consider investing in recruiting and onboarding all available talent. Although accustomed to waves of immigration, Europe experienced an unprecedented influx of refugees at the peak of the Syrian civil war in 2015. Since then, Europe's refugee population has continued to grow at an average rate of 16.3% per year. As of 2020 2.9 million refugees were settled across the continent, of which 1.65 million were located in France and Germany. About a third of the refugee population in these countries consists of women. This group represents an often overlooked but increasingly valuable segment of the workforce in Europe that can help alleviate labour gaps.

Across Europe, refugee women's employment rates remain relatively low at 45%, compared with 62% for refugee men. This gap does not represent a dearth of desire or ambition to join the workforce. Rather, it reflects the unique set of challenges refugee women encounter on the road to employment. These include lower proficiency in the official language(s) of the host country, limited access to professional networks, the unequal burden of childcare duties, and discrimination based on gender and immigration status. Despite these barriers, when given the opportunity, refugee women stand out as a highly motivated and resilient cohort of the workforce.

Beyond the short-term upfront costs in the recruiting and onboarding phases, hiring refugee women brings long-term benefits to companies, such as relatively high retention rates among this group and positive brand perception. In addition to the business benefits, there are also extensive positive social effects that follow when refugee women are integrated into the host country's workforce. Such integration not only offers economic independence to refugee

8

women and an additional source of income for their families, but it also provides an essential pathway for integration into the host society. Lasting change takes time—and is a continuous process—but there are a number of actions businesses can take now to proactively improve the outlook for refugee women's employment.

This report provides a set of actionable recommendations for companies on how to build tailored recruitment and workplace policies for refugee women to unlock these benefits. The most common and effective solutions among European companies highlighted in this report are to:

#### 1. SET CLEAR GOALS FOR HIRING REFUGEE WOMEN

Companies should develop a clear understanding of their own short- and long-term objectives with respect to hiring refugee women, and align internal resources, expectations and processes with those goals.

#### 2. PROMOTE INCLUSIVE RECRUITMENT

Companies should promote an inclusive recruiting environment that strives to identify, interview and hire diverse individuals while countering biases that may prevent a company from connecting with refugee women.

#### 3. CONTINUE INVESTING IN REFUGEE WOMEN AFTER RECRUITMENT

Companies should provide continued support and mentorship to refugee women beyond the onboarding phase to promote their growth within the company, which also boosts long-term talent development.

#### 4. WORK WITH EXTERNAL PARTNERS THAT HAVE KNOWLEDGE OF LOCAL CONTEXT FOR REFUGEE WOMEN

Companies should partner with organisations that are already connected with refugee women to develop a talent pool of candidates, learn best practices on hiring and integrating refugee women, and gain support during the recruitment process.

### 5. FOSTER A MORE INCLUSIVE CORPORATE CULTURE

Companies can open their doors to refugee women, but it's also important to create an inclusive corporate culture that encourages them to stay.



L Context on the refugee crisis in Europe since 2015



While the refugee crisis is not a new phenomenon in Europe, the number of refugees has grown significantly in recent years due to conflicts and crises around the

to conflicts and crises around the world, forcing millions of people to seek safety in nearly every country on the continent.<sup>1</sup> As of 2020 there were 2.9 million refugees in Europe, a number that has grown by 16%<sup>2</sup> per year on average since the height of the Syrian civil war in 2015.<sup>3</sup>

THE UN HIGH COMMISSIONER FOR REFUGEES (UNHCR) DEFINES REFUGEES AS PEOPLE WHO FLEE THEIR HOME COUNTRY DUE TO WAR, VIOLENCE, CONFLICT OR PERSECUTION.<sup>4</sup> In 2015 alone more than one million refugees arrived in Europe, mostly from Syria, Afghanistan and Iraq. The refugee crisis was, and remains, a deeply divisive and politically relevant issue in Europe. Despite the EU's efforts to build a common asylum policy, the current framework, the Common European Asylum System, gives ample policymaking discretion<sup>5</sup> to member states.<sup>6</sup> Accordingly, governments across the continent have had varied responses to the increased number of arrivals. The governments of France, Denmark and the UK,<sup>7</sup> among others, adopted restrictive policies that made it more difficult for people to seek refuge. On the other hand, some governments, such as Germany and Sweden, adopted more progressive migration policies to support the influx of refugees, recognising their potential as a new, talented and dedicated workforce that could make meaningful economic contributions, successfully assimilate into their new communities and fill local labour shortages.8

Refugee arrivals to the continent dropped considerably in 2016 and 2017 before levelling off in subsequent years, reaching close to 100,000 in 2019.<sup>9</sup> Covid-19-induced travel and border restrictions further decreased refugee arrivals in 2020, which dropped by 23% that year compared with a decrease of 13% in 2019. Despite this pandemic-related lull, an increase in refugee arrivals in Europe might soon return. Around the world, worsening conflicts,<sup>10</sup> political instability, economic collapse<sup>11</sup> and climate change<sup>12</sup> will only continue to drive an exodus of refugees.



### ▲ **Figure 1** | During 2020, refugees from Afghanistan, Iraq and Syria comprised the majority of the refugee population in Germany and Sweden.

Source: UNHCR Statistics

The recent withdrawal of the US military from Afghanistan and the subsequent takeover of the Afghan government by the Taliban, for instance, put millions of people at risk of persecution. The majority of them are likely to become internally displaced or flee to neighbouring countries like Iran and Pakistan. In the coming months, many Afghans might also be resettled in Europe.<sup>13</sup> Since April 2020, a gradually growing number of Afghans have sought asylum in Europe. Notably, the monthly number of asylum applications from Afghanistan in the EU-27 reached an all-year high of 5,740 in June 2021 (although this number remains well below the peak of more than 30,000 asylum applications in November 2015).<sup>14</sup> In the weeks prior to the US withdrawal from Afghanistan on August 30th 2021, more than 100,000 individuals were evacuated.<sup>15</sup> France and Germany have shown willingness to host Afghan refugees,<sup>16</sup> while the UK has pledged to resettle 5,000 over the coming year and another 15,000 thereafter.<sup>17</sup> Although the UN has called on the EU to resettle 42,500 Afghans over the next five years, the EU has stopped short of making any pledges.<sup>18</sup>



Afghan women are especially at risk of being persecuted by the new government, and many have fled and will continue seeking refuge in countries around the world. While refugee women make up approximately half of the world's refugee population, they disproportionately suffer the consequences of conflict, along with other vulnerable groups of the refugee population, such as LGBTQ people, children, and ethnic and religious minorities. Conflict and crisis in their home countries not only deprives women of basic needs, including water, sanitation, health, education and shelter, but also increases the threat of sexual violence and maternal mortality.<sup>19</sup>

In addition to the critical obstacles that confront refugee women in their countries of origin, they also face major challenges once they arrive and settle in a European host country. One of the most significant hurdles is finding fair, stable and meaningful work, which not only provides income to support themselves and their families, but also supports their integration into new communities. This report aims to diagnose these challenges with the objective of helping companies understand how they can reduce those barriers and support the integration of refugee women into the European workforce.

The research focuses on five of the largest refugee hosting countries in Europe—France, Germany, Sweden, Switzerland and the UK-to provide a picture of the current situation facing refugee women in Western Europe, as well as how companies have approached hiring and integrating this population in recent years. Among the five countries, Germany and France are the largest hosting countries, with a combined refugee population of 1.65 million as of 2020, of which around a third are women.<sup>20</sup> This report makes the strategic business case for hiring refugee women, a highly resilient and talented potential workforce. The report also presents case studies of four companies that have successfully implemented programmes for hiring and integrating refugee women into the workforce.

Finally, the report offers actionable recommendations for European businesses that seek to recruit refugee women and develop programmes that help them succeed in the workplace.



## II.

Refugee women employment lagging behind refugee men, native-born women Many refugees struggle to find employment, and refugee women are dismally underemployed. On average, across EU countries, only 45% of refugee women had a job versus 62% of refugee men, even before the 2015 crisis.

EU-level data on refugee labour force participation and refugee employment rates remain scarce and outdated, often covering periods prior to the 2015 migration crisis. Nonetheless, the available evidence reveals that the employment rate among newly arrived refugees increases over time, sometimes taking more than a decade to approach that of the nativeborn population. According to a 2016 OECD study<sup>21</sup> analysing data from the 2014 EU Labour Force Survey (LFS),<sup>22</sup> newly arrived refugees in Europe often struggle to find employment. Only one in four refugees is employed within five years of arrival. A decade after their arrival, refugees are employed at a higher rate, of 56%, but this is still below that of the native-born population. It can take up to 20 years, on average, for refugees to enjoy similar employment rates as native-born Europeans.

Studies also show that refugee women are likely to experience much lower levels of employment compared with refugee men, especially in the first few years after arrival. Delving into country-level statistics, a survey carried out by the French Ministry of Interior<sup>23</sup> on refugees who arrived in France and were granted a permanent residency in 2009 shows that employment rates among refugees increased from nearly 30% within a year of obtaining residency to 60% three years later. However, employment rates remained much lower among refugee women (43%) compared with refugee men (70%) three years after obtaining residency. In Germany, a more recent IAB-BAMF-SOEP<sup>24</sup> survey of refugees who arrived between 2013 and 2019 shows that employment rates among refugees increased from less than 10% within the first year of arrival to around 50% for those who had been in the country for at least five years. Yet among the refugee population who had been in the country for more than five years, the employment rate for refugee women was 28% compared with 60% for refugee men.

The employment gap between refugee women and native-born women in the wake of the 2015 refugee crisis was especially stark. In Germany, which hosts the largest refugee population in Europe, refugee women had an average employment rate of just 13% in 2017,<sup>25</sup> far below 74% for native German women. In the same year, in the UK, refugee women were employed at half the rate of native-born women (35% vs 71%, respectively). Sweden, which is doing comparably better, had a 55% refugee-women employment rate compared with 80% for native-born women in 2017 (Figure 2).





▲ **Figure 2** | Employment rates of refugee women are the lowest compared with refugee men, non-EU born migrants and native-born populations in Germany, the UK, and Sweden (2017).

Source: Eurostat (Labour force survey), Brücker, Herbert, et. al. (2020), Kone, Zovanga, et. al., and Statistics Sweden



# III.

Europe's worker shortage: How refugee women can help close the gap An ageing population will contribute to a shrinking workforce and create significant worker shortages, a trend currently exacerbated by the covid-19 pandemic. Refugee women are an often overlooked workforce that, when proactively hired, can alleviate labour gaps.

It is estimated that one in four people in Europe will be over 65 by 2030, as a result of rising life expectancy and falling fertility rates.<sup>26</sup> Accordingly, the workingage population in Europe is expected to shrink by 13.5 million (4%) between 2018 and 2030, with Germany alone losing 4 million (8%) by 2030.<sup>27</sup>

The economic impact of this demographic change is already being felt in the form of labour shortages across various sectors of the European economy.<sup>28</sup> Even before the pandemic, approximately a third of European companies in the construction sector mentioned labour shortages as a factor limiting production during the first quarter of 2020, followed by the manufacturing (~20%) and services (~18%) sectors. These impacts were felt differently across the continent. During 2019, for example, Eastern European countries reported the highest perceived shortages in the construction and manufacturing sectors, mainly as a result of expanding production in the aftermath of an economic crisis, emigration to Western Europe, and an ageing population. By contrast, Northern and Western Europe experienced the largest shortages in the services sector, where women tend to work in higher proportions.<sup>29,30</sup> Businesses experience the direct impact of Europe's labour shortages in their daily operations—including rising labour costs, higher turnover rates and the time taken to fill open positions, all of which have the potential to hamper business growth.

The covid-19 pandemic exacerbated existing labour shortages by limiting internal EU labour migration, a critical source of talent for many countries. Reluctance of former workers to return to the same jobs due to health concerns, and a preference for jobs that allow for remote work, may be part of a new, long-term shift, forcing employers in labour-intensive industries to find, train and retain new workers. Employers hiring for low- or mid-level consumerfacing jobs (eg, hospitality, retail, personal services and restaurant workers) will encounter increasing competition for labour in the post-pandemic world.<sup>31</sup> Furthermore, structural shifts in the European economy, such as the move to carbon neutrality and the ongoing digital transformation, will further worsen labour shortages by increasing skills requirements.<sup>32</sup> The construction, energy, manufacturing and transport sectors are some of the industries most likely to be in need of new workers in the postpandemic economy.33

Higher labour force participation rates of women and people aged over 55 can help to alleviate the burden of a shrinking workforce. In addition, businesses should proactively consider investing in recruiting diverse talent including refugee women, a group often overlooked by businesses.

19



# IV. The business case for hiring refugee women

Some major European companies have already adopted recruitment and training programmes to successfully include refugee women in the workforce. Businesses that hire and retain refugee women stand to benefit in a variety of ways.

Some European companies are already rethinking their hiring processes in a changing labour market and turning to the refugee population-in particular women-to meet their hiring needs. Companies hire refugee women not only to fill their vacant roles with talented, resilient and loyal workers, but also because of the business benefits. In fact, these companies are building a diverse and inclusive workplace as well as investing in talent development, which research has shown can boost consumer loyalty, enhance employee engagement and improve worker retention. Major companies across Europe have recognised the potential of refugee women as a valuable workforce. For example, IKEA, a global furniture and houseware company headquartered in Sweden, has developed programmes to recruit refugees for logistics and customer relations roles.<sup>34</sup> Other major multinational companies such as Starbucks, Amazon, PayPal and PwC, with talent needs ranging from low- to highskilled jobs, are also recruiting refugee women to meet their hiring needs.35

Consumer goods and retail companies have also discovered the benefits of hiring refugee women. For example, IKEA, H&M, and Primark have been hiring refugee women with the express purpose of adapting to the changing demographics of their clientele, which is increasingly female and multiethnic.<sup>36</sup> Research shows consumers are more comfortable shopping in stores reflecting their own diversity. Companies are integrating their diversity and inclusion goals with their hiring practices to gain consumer support; a 2019 study conducted by the NYU Stern School of Business and sponsored by Tent shows that women and young consumers in Germany and France are more likely to respond favourably to brands that publicly support refugees. In particular, young consumers aged 18 to 35 in both countries are more likely to buy products from a brand that is hiring refugees.<sup>37</sup>

Additionally, companies that invest in recruiting refugee women are more likely to have lower turnover rates among their employees, which reduces recruitment costs in the long term, although evidence remains limited for Europe. According to research conducted by the Fiscal Policy Institute and sponsored by Tent, once refugees find a welcoming work environment they tend to stay longer. For example, the turnover rate was almost three times higher among all workers (11%) compared with refugees (4%) among firms surveyed in the US manufacturing sector.<sup>39</sup> In other sectors, like meatpacking and hotels, turnover rates were also lower among refugees.<sup>40</sup>

Like all employees, refugee women thrive in the workplace when employers continuously invest in their professional development. The difference lies in the type of investment and training needed. By identifying the unique set of challenges that often inhibit refugee women from entering the workforce (see Section V), companies can focus on developing the right programmes for recruiting and training that improve refugee women's access to employment and support their professional growth. To change the current paradigm—in which refugee women are falling behind their female native-born peers and male refugees when it comes to employment—companies must recognise their role in reducing the barriers to work for refugee women, and invest in solutions that help hire and retain them as workers. The business rewards, including filling vacancies, building a diverse workforce and positive consumer perception of the brand, can be significant and outweigh initial investments. Benefits accrue across the wider economy as well. According to an International Rescue Committee (IRC) study, if refugee women were employed at the same rate as the rest of the female population in their host countries, their economic and social contributions could be enormous. Today, closing the earnings and employment gaps for refugees in Germany, for instance, which has the largest refugee population in Europe, could boost its GDP by US\$14bn.<sup>41</sup>





### V.

Understanding the labour market challenges facing refugee women Refugee women face several challenges when entering the European job market, including limited proficiency in the official language(s) of the host country, limited access to professional networks, high burden of family and childcare duties, and discrimination based on gender and immigration status in the host country. Once hired, this group confronts significant wage gaps due to their status as women and refugees.

When entering the European labour market, both refugee men and women are at a disadvantage as a result of having been forced to leave their country of origin. In the first few years after arriving in a host country, refugees are likely to have limited proficiency in the official language(s) of the host country, fewer years of formal educational attainment, limited access to social support networks and professional connections, and can be subject to discrimination based on their nationality, culture, race, religion and other negative biases.<sup>42</sup> For refugee women, these challenges are compounded by existing gender discrimination that affect all women regardless of immigration status. Gender stereotypes may also be aggravated in refugee family households, as it is common for refugee men to be first to seek employment in a host country while refugee women are expected to be the primary caregiver.

In addition to these potential obstacles in the host country, refugee women may have also experienced gender-based discrimination in professional, social and academic settings in their country of origin, which may translate to having lower levels of education, less marketable skills and less work experience than men from their country of origin. While this is not true across the board, and some refugee women arrive in Europe with extensive career trajectories and robust professional skills, it is important to recognise the various layers of disadvantages this group may have faced prior to entering the European job market. Even those refugee women who do have the experience, skills and language proficiency needed to successfully pursue work in a host country may find the path to validating their credentials onerous, hindering their participation in the workforce.

### CHALLENGE 1: FEWER YEARS OF FORMAL EDUCATIONAL ATTAINMENT

On average, refugee women experience a lag in formal education compared with refugee men, other non-EU born migrant women and the host country's female population. However, the exact extent of this lag varies widely by country of origin.<sup>43</sup> In 2014 54.3% of refugee women completed upper secondary education or above,<sup>44</sup> compared with 59.6% of refugee men, 61.9% of other migrant women and 74.5% of nativeborn EU women. <sup>45,46</sup> A baseline of lower education delays language acquisition for refugee women and reduces their job prospects; for example, only 30% of refugee women with a low level of education<sup>47</sup> were employed in 2014, according to the 2014 EU LFS. By contrast, highly educated refugee women<sup>48</sup> had an employment rate close to 69%.





Source: Liebig, Thomas, and Tronstad, Kristian Rose (2018)

#### **CHALLENGE 2:**

### LOWER LEVEL OF HOST-COUNTRY LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY

In general, refugees face higher language barriers compared with other migrant groups, especially in the early years after arrival. According to the 2014 LFS, less than half (45%) of refugees in Europe reported having an advanced knowledge of the host-country language, compared with two-thirds of migrants from non-EU countries.<sup>49</sup> Additionally, refugee women were slightly disadvantaged compared with refugee men, and more likely to self-report as having little to no knowledge of the host-country language across Europe—around 22% of refugee women reported beginner levels of language proficiency versus 18% of refugee men (Figure 3). However, it remains unclear whether the differences in language proficiency between refugee men and women are as pronounced today following the 2015 migration crisis that mostly brought refugees from Afghanistan, Iraq and Syria to Europe. Apart from Iraq, where an estimated 35% of the population speaks English,<sup>50</sup> anecdotal evidence suggests that less than 10% of the population in Afghanistan and Syria speak English, and those that do speak English are likely to be individuals with higher levels of education than the general population.<sup>51,52</sup> While language proficiency is a barrier to employment for all refugees, refugee women also face additional challenges when trying to acquire new language skills. As noted, refugee women typically arrive with fewer years of formal education compared with refugee men and other migrant women, delaying language acquisition.<sup>53</sup> Language acquisition skills are crucial because higher levels of language proficiency

translate into better employment prospects for refugee women. According to the 2014 OECD study, refugee women with intermediate or advanced proficiency in the host country's language enjoy an employment rate of nearly 60%, compared with around 23% for women with beginner-level proficiency (Figure 4).



Women Beginner Women - Intermediate/advanced Men - Intermediate/advanced

Source: Liebig, Thomas, and Tronstad, Kristian Rose (2018)



#### CHALLENGE 3:

#### **TRADITIONAL GENDER NORMS**

Traditional gender norms put an unequal burden of childcare and domestic duties on women. In particular, this burden is amplified for refugee women, with evidence from Norway and Sweden indicating that they typically experience a peak in fertility within the first three years of their arrival in the host country (since they feel more secure and stable in the host country than when they were in transit).<sup>54</sup> Consequently, refugee women are more likely to prioritise household and caregiving responsibilities and thus have narrower windows of opportunity to acquire language and other skills to increase their employability. In fact, female labour force participation rates in countries of origin serve as a strong predictor of labour market integration levels upon arrival in host countries. Notably, Afghanistan, Syria and Iraq, the top countries of origin for refugees, also have some of the lowest labour force participation rates for women (Figure 5).<sup>55</sup>

Furthermore, within the family unit, refugee men are often given priority when a job becomes available and employment opportunities are scarce. According to the World Values Survey 2017-2020, a significantly higher number of respondents from countries where refugees generally originate agreed with the statement "when jobs are scarce, men should have more right to a job than women" compared with respondents in European countries. For instance, for refugees from Iran and Iraq, 70% and 78% of respondents respectively agreed with the statement. By contrast, in Germany and France, the largest refugee-hosting countries, 11.5% and 9.2% of respondents respectively agreed with the statement.<sup>56</sup>



Figure 5 | With the exception of Eritrea, the labour force participation gap between refugee men and women was

Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators





Note: Data not available for Afghanistan, Eritrea and Syria. Source: World Values Survey Wave 7: 2017-2020, Q33

The persistence of these traditional gender role expectations impede the labour market integration of refugee women, which can, in turn, perpetuate false narratives. Given low employment rates among refugee women, employers may perceive refugee women as not being interested in formal work, or that there is a dearth of candidates among refugee women who are competitive with native-born candidates.

#### CHALLENGE 4:

### LIMITED ACCESS TO SOCIAL AND PROFESSIONAL NETWORKS

Even when companies proactively seek refugee women out, this group's ability to participate in recruitment programmes can be hindered by their little knowledge of the local job market and limited access to social and professional networks in the host country.<sup>57</sup> Companies interviewed as part of this study observed that informational recruitment sessions were largely attended by refugee men and rarely by refugee women. The traditional role of refugee men as the "breadwinner" of the household provides them with more opportunities for interaction with the local community and other refugees.<sup>58</sup> Thus, they are more likely to hear about and participate in recruitment sessions.

Barilla, an Italian multinational food company that has an active refugee recruitment programme, reported that informal meet and greet sessions as part of the recruitment process failed to attract female candidates—until they organised separate femaleonly programmes.

#### **CHALLENGE 5:**

### ONCE EMPLOYED, LACK OF SUPPORT RESPONSIVE TO THE NEEDS OF REFUGEE WOMEN

Both the host country's social safety net and the traditional workplace environment can fall short of providing accommodations that would make it easier and more accessible for refugee women to enter the workforce. For instance, according to a non-government organisation (NGO) based in Europe, the local social welfare system for childcare is difficult for refugee women to access. Unable to access existing childcare systems, refugee women find it difficult to enter the workforce full time, limiting their career options. In office environments, another NGO we interviewed noted that an employer's lack of understanding about some refugee women's religious and cultural practices, such as wearing headscarves or rules around physical contact with members of the opposite sex, can inhibit refugee women from feeling comfortable and safe in the workplace. Other religious accommodations, such as providing prayer breaks during the workday, are not a common employer practice in Europe. Furthermore, for refugee women, public transport often raises concerns of safety, costs and distance. The lack of convenient modes of transport to and from work acts as a logistical hurdle to employment.

#### **CHALLENGE 6:**

### ARDUOUS PROCESS OF CREDENTIAL VERIFICATION

For refugees, the path to getting foreign academic credentials and professional qualifications verified and validated<sup>59</sup> is often complex and hinders, in particular, highly skilled, educated workers, including refugee women, from accessing jobs for which they are qualified. Within Europe, the process of assessing the qualifications of refugees<sup>60</sup> varies depending on whether the host country's gualification recognition system is centralised (like Norway) or decentralised (like Germany).<sup>61</sup> In decentralised systems, some professions fall under the domain of federal governments to verify, whereas others are under the jurisdiction of provincial governments. This makes the credential verification process less transparent and more complicated for refugees to follow. In addition, accessing services for translating, verifying and officially validating academic or professional credentials can be costly, and therefore deter refugee women from seeking jobs that may require credentials, often pushing them into jobs that they are overqualified for.

Additionally, refugee women often come from countries where the business environment and education system are not well known. Many lack appropriate supporting documentation to show their educational and professional experiences,<sup>62</sup> which makes it difficult for employers to assess the applicants' capabilities. These uncertainties are interpreted as business risks and additional costs by employers, and employers are more likely to choose candidates whose credentials are familiar. The lack of easily verifiable credentials can contribute to the harmful perception among many employers that refugee women are "risky candidates".<sup>63</sup>

### CHALLENGE 7: LOWER WAGES

Even when refugee women manage to secure a job, their challenges do not necessarily end. Once hired, they often experience lower wages than refugee men and native-born women. In 2019 women's gross hourly earnings were on average 14.1% below those of men in the EU, and this has only changed minimally over the last decade (Figure 7).<sup>64</sup> Varying pay gaps exist across all EU countries: they can be as wide as 22% (Estonia) or narrow as 1% (Luxembourg).

The gender gap for refugee women in Europe is compounded by their status as a refugee, resulting in the lowest wage rate compared with refugee men, native-born men and native-born women. In 2019 the IRC estimated the hourly earnings of refugee women in Germany to be 17.4% less than refugee men's, 37.5% less than native-born women's, and 51% less than native-born men's earnings.<sup>65</sup> Low-wage employment among refugee women has detrimental implications. If wages cannot cover the cost of external childcare, refugee women with children may choose to stay out of the workforce entirely rather than having to dig into their income to work outside of their household.

# ▲ **Figure 7** | This % shows the average wage gap between women and men's gross hourly earnings in 2019 across the EU. During 2019 the average unadjusted wage gap in the EU-27 was 14.1%, with large variations among countries.



Source: Eurostat (2021)



## VI.

Net positive: Investing in refugee women's talent Businesses often have a perception that hiring refugees entails high upfront costs, discouraging employers from hiring refugee women. In reality, direct costs are often recouped in a few years, and sometimes in as little as six months.

Given the wide range of challenges, European businesses may rightly wonder if the costs and risks associated with hiring refugee women are outweighed by the benefits. Accounting for both direct and indirect benefits, the answer is a clear "yes".

Boston Consulting Group (BCG), a global management consultancy, surveyed 300 German companies that had integrated 2,500 refugees into their workforce.66 It found that additional integration costs associated with hiring refugees (such as language training, vocational training and wraparound services like finding housing) amounted to a 40% premium on normal recruitment costs. However, these additional costs were typically recouped by the company within a year, mostly from additional revenue generated as a result of filling understaffed jobs, as well as from government subsidies.<sup>67,68</sup> Sometimes the return on investment is even quicker. For some companies facing shortages of skilled labour, like Kremer Machine Systems,<sup>69</sup> which invested around €6,200 per refugee hired in Germany, costs were recovered within six months of recruitment.

Additional evidence supports the notion that investing in refugees as workers can benefit the wider economy, refugees themselves *and* the company hiring them. A study by the Swedish Public Employment Service (SPES) evaluated whether a job search assistance (JSA) programme —a support programme<sup>70</sup> complementary to standard public employment services—can improve labour market outcomes among recent immigrants who are having difficulty finding employment in Sweden. A cost-benefit analysis estimated that both direct and indirect revenue, in terms of salaries earned by refugees<sup>71</sup> and increased production, could offset the costs associated with this programme in less than three years.<sup>72</sup>

WHILE REFUGEE WOMEN ARE LIKELY TO START WITH LOWER LEVELS OF FORMAL EDUCATION THAN THE NATIVE-BORN POPULATION IN EUROPE, THERE IS A PERCEPTION THAT THIS CHALLENGE CANNOT BE OVERCOME. IN FACT, ACCESS TO PROFESSIONAL NETWORKS, MENTORSHIP AND TRAINING BOLSTERS REFUGEE WOMEN'S EXPERIENCE AND QUALIFICATIONS.

Collaboration with local and national government partners can indeed go a long way in reducing recruitment costs for employers, whether through direct financial subsidies, pre-employment training, logistical support and/or job matching support. Staples, a global office retail company, leveraged the resources provided by the JSA programme funded by SPES in Sweden to recruit refugee candidates, including refugee women. The JSA programme also allowed Staples to provide ongoing Swedishlanguage training to hired candidates. In Germany, firms are able to recoup part of their investment in hiring refugees through a government subsidy scheme.<sup>73</sup> In France, IKEA worked with a governmentfunded programme, the Operational Program for Collective Employment, to find and train qualified candidates to match IKEA's needs.

Employers often rely on a person's level of education as a proxy of their actual skills, which is more difficult to observe.<sup>74</sup> Even if refugees have the required skills for a certain job, they are more likely to be perceived as low-skilled; consequently, they are less likely to find employment opportunities. In such cases, a hiring process that focuses on measuring skills or potential rather than credentials can be more effective. For example, a company representative at Adidas, a multinational sportswear manufacturer, stressed how employment agencies in Germany were failing to capture the potential of refugees, pointing to an individual from Syria with over five years of HR experience being offered a truck-driving position. Accordingly, Adidas conducted its own recruitment to find talent among refugees rather than relying on government employment agencies. By reaching out to refugee networks within universities, the company managed to attract 70 refugees to a single event to discuss their programme and conduct interviews, while only five individuals had registered the day before.

In cases where refugees do not have the necessary skills, the right training within companies can get high-potential candidates up to speed. For instance, Adidas offers part-time apprenticeships allowing refugee women to juggle career and household responsibilities. The company also invests time in mentoring refugee women, which can significantly improve performance, as they feel motivated and more confident about their skills. While pilot training programmes tend to incur higher costs, these costs are likely to fall when programmes are scaled, making them a more worthwhile investment. Collaboration with government agencies and NGOs working directly with refugees can help by providing training that targets both the specific needs of the company and those of refugee women seeking employment. Adidas also partnered with universities and refugee networks to bolster qualifications and ensure that refugees have peer support.

The benefits of these investments, both direct (such as increased revenue and lower turnover) and indirect (such as a younger and more diverse workforce, and positive brand perception for consumers) grows over time. One such example of a company that is investing in the long-term benefits of training this workforce is Volkswagen, a German vehicle manufacturer. The company has implemented social, professional and educational integration programmes for refugees across its brands in Germany. According to an interview with a project co-ordinator for Refugee Aid at Volkswagen Group, nearly 6,000 refugees have participated in these integration programmes to date.<sup>75</sup> Although the majority of these participants are not working directly at Volkswagen, they are more likely to integrate into the labour force in the future, contributing to the overall economy.

Internships are also particularly effective in providing both the companies and refugees with exposure to each other prior to formal employment.<sup>76</sup> According to an interview with a multinational organisation headquartered in Europe, the company encourages their suppliers to allow refugees without previous working experience to apply for certain jobs, in line with their own policies. More specifically, their suppliers organised 10-week vocational training courses for refugee women in order to expose them to both technical and production-related knowledge. Successful trainees may be offered positions within their supplier networks.<sup>77</sup>

36


DESPITE LOW LABOUR FORCE PARTICIPATION RATES, EVIDENCE FROM EUROPEAN COUNTRIES SHOWS THAT REFUGEE WOMEN ARE MORE LIKELY TO JOIN THE LABOUR FORCE COMPARED WITH WOMEN IN THEIR COUNTRY OF ORIGIN. COMPANIES CAN ATTRACT APPLICANTS BY TAKING INTO ACCOUNT GENDER NORMS AND GEOGRAPHICAL LOCATIONS.

Evidence shows that refugee women are interested and ready to work, even if they did not formerly do so in their country of origin. In Sweden, the labour force participation of refugee women from all but one key country of origin was higher than the labour participation rate of women in their country of origin.<sup>78</sup> Similarly, according to the IAB-BAMF-SOEP survey of refugees who arrived in Germany between 2013 and 2016,<sup>79</sup> 85% of refugee women respondents who are not economically active stated that they "certainly/ likely" aspire to work in the future.<sup>80</sup>

More specifically, the participation of refugee women in the labour force seems to be incentivised by the financial need to add earnings to family income. According to the OECD, the average weekly hours a family of four<sup>81</sup> needed to work to escape poverty in 2018 was 47 hours (at minimum wage) in EU28 countries, which suggests that both parents might need to be employed for certain households to make a decent living. In a recent survey of refugees in Germany, less than a third of men and women respondents said it would be problematic if the wife was earning more than her husband, which could suggest that the participation of women in the workforce is socially acceptable in the refugee community, and perceived to be financially beneficial.<sup>82</sup>

Refugee women have even been quite willing to enter professions that are typically considered "male dominated" when companies proactively take steps to shift gender norms by promoting the recruitment of women for these roles, and providing training and support that goes beyond the hiring phase. As a representative from Volkswagen observed, refugee women employees exhibit a great deal of tenacity in breaking gender norms to succeed in a sector that is historically male dominated.<sup>83</sup> Refugee women demonstrate a tremendous amount of flexibility and adaptability, qualities that are in demand in today's labour market.

To integrate this highly motivated cohort in the workforce, companies should carefully consider their recruitment strategies. For example, it is important to avoid hidden messaging that may deter refugee women from applying. IKEA found that job descriptions with phrases such as "transportation of heavy furniture" or "may require early hours or late evenings" deterred refugee women from applying, even though these were not core job responsibilities. Considering specific and core requirements versus preferred qualities when writing job descriptions can help refugee women understand the company's needs and apply accordingly. Barilla experienced difficulty in recruiting refugee women who assumed that the work environment (a factory) implied a requirement to lift heavy equipment and a male-dominated workforce. To counter this misconception, Barilla ran recruitment advertisements narrated by a female employee to help dispel perceptions refugee women may have about gender norms in the workplace.

There is also a clear imperative to take the workplace's location into account and assess if extra measures might be needed to attract and support refugee women specifically. For IKEA France, the number of women refugee trainees varies significantly depending on the location. In Paris, the classes are more likely to have a gender balance, whereas outside the city classes skew towards men. Public transport in urban areas makes it easier for women to attend classes, in lieu of needing a driver's license and car, which are often needed in more suburban or rural areas. Childcare is also easier to find in the city. In order to attract refugee women in certain locations, employers will need to propose sustainable solutions for transport and childcare.

#### **CASE STUDIES:**

#### EXPERIENCES OF COMPANIES IN EUROPE WORKING TOWARDS HIRING REFUGEE WOMEN

The following case studies collect key information about the experiences of companies in Europe that are recruiting and hiring refugee women. Each case study provides an overview of the company's core operations, history of the initiative to hire refugee women, details on the programme's structure and how it was implemented, outcomes of the initiative, challenges the company encountered, and solutions it deployed.

#### **CASE STUDY 1: BARILLA** Aligning recruitment with corporate values and business needs

Barilla is the world's largest pasta maker with factories in over 30 sites, 15 of which are outside Italy. As of 2020 Barilla has a net turnover of US\$3.9bn and employs 8,900+ workers globally.

Five out of eight countries that Barilla operates in are major refugee-hosting countries: Italy, France, Germany, Turkey and Sweden. Barilla has one of its largest factories in the Swedish municipality of Filipstad, a rural area that welcomed the most refugees out of all municipalities in Sweden. In fact, Sweden took on the most refugees per capita in Europe in 2015, and nearly 2.6% of its population are refugees.<sup>84</sup>

As the biggest private employer in Filipstad for the past 80 years, Barilla's employees traditionally stay for life, starting with the company when they are 20 and retiring at 65. An ageing labour force in Sweden has meant that existing employees at the site are nearing retirement, creating the need for an influx of younger workers. Hiring refugees was an opportunity to bring in a younger and more diverse pool of employees that reflect broader social demographics. The effort was spearheaded by Barilla's diversity and inclusion board, which provides recommendations to the company on initiatives that enhance equality and inclusion.

Furthermore, because Barilla is an important part of the local economy, the company realised it could play an important role in facilitating refugees' integration with the local population and ease potential tensions through its hiring practices. Barilla did this by setting up a refugee hiring programme with two key stakeholders: the municipal unemployment office and SFI (Swedish for Immigrants) in Filipstad. SFI is a free language learning programme run by Swedish municipalities for newly arrived adult immigrants, including refugees.

Barilla's six-month training programme for refugees in Filipstad has two rotating elements: two weeks of language training and two weeks of on-the-job training with local Swedish employees. To allow refugee trainees to focus on practicing their Swedish language skills and job training, Barilla designs trainee cohorts that consist of refugees who come from different countries of origin and do not speak each other's mother tongues. Hiring initially in small numbers gives the existing workplace and new refugee trainees time to become comfortable with each other, which helps to alleviate backlash and fear among the local population that refugees are taking local jobs.

While the first two programmes were successful, Barilla quickly realised that there was a gender imbalance—80% of participants in their initial cohort were male. By contrast, the gender balance among local employees is close to parity something highly valued by Barilla.

To reach such a gender balance, Barilla developed a female-only training programme in 2019 and made efforts to address refugee women's concerns, such as the fact that they might be the only woman working in the plant, as well as common misconceptions that jobs at factories are "for men". Barilla also realised that refugee women sometimes lacked knowledge of the host country's working environment and, even more so, were unfamiliar with working in a factory environment, which discouraged them from applying for vacancies. To counter this, Barilla ran radio ads about the vacancies, using existing female workers' voices to signal gender inclusion at their factories. As a result of these interventions, Barilla received many more applications from refugee women for potential vacancies. The company was able to successfully lead its first all-women refugee training and recruitment programme in Filipstad.

#### CASE STUDY 2: IKEA

Dispelling gendered notions about jobs to pave a path to employment for refugee women

IKEA is the world's largest furniture retailer. The company has over 445 locations globally, with 70% of its stores located in Europe. IKEA employs 208,000 people globally and added 19 stores in 2020.85

IKEA's "Refugee Skills for Employment" programme aims to train 2,500 refugees globally, making it easier for them to find a job at IKEA or with other employers. The programme is co-ordinated globally and implemented nationally. Working with the governments of countries where it operates as well as local non-government organisations to identify refugee candidates, the company then uses a combination of private, government and employee incentives to recruit refugee workers.

For example, in France, IKEA worked with a government-funded programme, the Operational Program for Collective Employment, to find and train qualified refugee candidates to match IKEA's labour needs. Refugee trainees are motivated to complete the training and join IKEA through incentives such as a two-month salary payment upon successful employment. In collaboration with the French government, IKEA developed a two-month training programme for refugee job candidates followed by a three-week on-the-job training course once they were formally hired. The programme incorporated soft skills training along with job-related skills in logistics and customer relations, the two areas where IKEA had the greatest business needs. The programme has been successful in retaining 85% of refugee trainees as full-time employees at IKEA stores.

In France—as well as in other European countries— IKEA found it challenging to reach gender parity among refugee trainees. Several factors led to a lower number of refugee women participating in the training programmes, including:

- Limited access to public transport
- Limited affordable childcare
- Job descriptions that discourage women

To encourage female participation in its training programme, IKEA France focused on countering job-related gender misconceptions among refugee women. Traditionally, at IKEA there are more men in logistics positions and more women in customer relations roles. By providing training for all refugee trainees in both logistics and customer relations regardless of gender, some refugee women chose logistics as their point of entry into IKEA. Allowing trainees to experience both roles regardless of gender enabled refugee women to explore a different job than they might have otherwise chosen. This may lead to higher retention in the long run, as refugee women realise a broader range of career paths are open to them.

Improving the internal corporate culture to be more supportive of refugees, as well as refugee women, is also a priority for the company. IKEA France uses different internal communication tools to sensitise employees about refugees and their situation:

- HR teams and store managers participate in training modules to understand the refugee journey.
- IKEA organises diversity and inclusion training for existing employees about recognising unconscious biases.

 Employees participate in scenario training, an exercise that simulates real-life situations in the workplace related to interactions between existing employees and refugees. It helps avoid incidents where current employees feel uncomfortable dealing with situations that may arise with refugees and equips them with the tools they need to communicate and resolve issues.

In addition, each refugee trainee in the programme is paired with a mentor who can address questions and concerns. IKEA invites former refugee trainees who successfully completed the programme and are currently employed at IKEA to share their experiences with the trainee class. They provide a source of inspiration to the new candidates and help convey that it's possible to build a career at IKEA.

Lastly, each country team at IKEA organises a monthly meeting to share success stories and implementation strategies, allowing the company to continue improving their refugee hiring efforts.

#### CASE STUDY 3: ADIDAS Building refugee women's confidence to apply for new jobs

adidas is a sports company headquartered in Germany. It is the largest sporting goods manufacturer in Europe and second in the world, with revenue of €20bn in 2020.<sup>86</sup> adidas employs 62,300+ workers globally.

adidas started a refugee programme in 2015 in response to the influx of refugees in Europe, and Germany in particular. While the company initially provided in-kind support and financial donations to welcome new arrivals, they soon realised there was an opportunity to integrate refugees for the long term.

While the company had already been offering short internships for refugees, adidas extended these to at least six months to better identify their full potential. adidas decided to partner with universities and refugee networks instead of solely relying on German employment agencies that tend to focus on credentials, which can be difficult for refugees to obtain. As a result, the word spread quickly about adidas' Integration programme and many refugees turned up eager to find work.

The purpose of adidas's programme is not limited to hiring refugees at the company, but also providing necessary training so refugees can integrate more easily into German society. Some of the six-month internship provides refugees with the opportunity to rotate among various departments and be exposed to different types of roles. Separately, adidas offers Future Talent positions, including apprenticeship and dualstudy programmes, where refugees rotate across different departments over a period of 2 or 3 years. Depending on the needs of the company, they can be offered permanent contracts at the conclusion of the programme.

adidas started an application process open to refugees. Initially, a low number of refugee women applicants was observed. Out of the initial 100+ programme applicants, only six were women. To break down these barriers, the company held women employees-led events, which in turn empowered participants and boosted their confidence to apply for these positions. As a result, the share of refugee women in the latest cohort of participants increased to 50%, compared with about 15% in previous cohorts.

Recognising that refugee women face unique barriers, such as childcare responsibilities, adidas offers tailor-made solutions like part-time internships, mentoring, and coaching to encourage greater refugee women's participation.

#### **CASE STUDY 4: STAPLES SWEDEN** Language and cultural integration are part of corporate talent development

Staples is a global office supply retail company headquartered in the US with operations across 50 countries, supplying 31 European countries from ten operations in Europe. In addition to Staples' B2B arm, the company also has 260 retail outlets across Europe. Globally, it employs 74,000 people and has annual revenue of around US\$9bn as of 2020.<sup>87</sup>

In 2019 Staples Sweden developed a programme to help newly arrived immigrants, including refugees, integrate into Swedish society. Driven by a need to contribute to an inclusive society, the company's management wanted to create employment opportunities for refugees, and gave local store managers the option to voluntarily participate in a hiring programme for this population. Accordingly, Staples approached the Swedish Public Employment Service (Swedish PES) and began working with the agency through its Job Search Assistance (JSA) channel to develop job descriptions and profiles of refugee and immigrant candidates.

The programme's goal is to find the right candidates for Staples, regardless of gender. In the first and second cohorts, five candidates were interviewed and two women were selected for the positions. Staples plans to continue the programme, adding 1-2 full-time refugee women employees annually to its workforce. Staples credits the PES/JSA with the careful matching of candidates so that Staples could consider strong male and female refugee and immigrant candidates. The JSA programme works in conjunction with PES to provide job preparation and training to candidates, especially those often deemed "unemployable", including low-skilled refugee women.

Programme participants were given a fixed-term contract of approximately one year and, based on performance, would receive a permanent contract at the end of the fixed term. According to Staples, it was important to treat refugees the same as local employees, by providing a clear path for career growth rather than treating them as a short-term hire.

Language barriers were cited as a key challenge facing refugee women during the recruitment process. To help address this, PES provides language training to refugee job-seekers for 2-3 years while they work to match these candidates with jobs. In addition, Staples made the conscious decision to predominantly speak Swedish with their refugee hires (although most Swedish people can speak English) in order to help them learn the language more effectively, thereby encouraging faster integration into Swedish society. Programme participants have found this effective even if difficult at the onset. PES also provided Staples with several months of funding to reduce the pressure (and risk) for the company to take on refugee trainees and, concurrently, reduce pressure on refugees to perform immediately at the same level of a local hire.



# VII. Recommendations

# Each country and company faces unique challenges in terms of recruiting and hiring refugee women, but some generalised best practices can be drawn from the experiences of companies that have been interviewed for this study. This section outlines 17 recommendations across five stages of recruitment and integration, which should be viewed as a toolkit that can be mixed and matched to suit each company's

## SET CLEAR GOALS FOR HIRING REFUGEE WOMEN:

unique needs.

Companies should develop a clear understanding of their own short- and long-term objectives with respect to hiring refugee women, and align internal resources, expectations and processes with those goals. This includes:

#### Identifying short-versus long-term goals

 Setting goals can help prioritise actions with long-term benefits that outweigh the shortterm investment costs. For instance, setting a goal to have refugee women comprise a certain percentage of the workforce by a certain point in time (e.g. three years from today) can help companies develop plans and establish milestones to measure progress.  Identifying short-term milestones can make the long-term goals more manageable. Setting specific annual targets, such as increasing female refugee internship applications or investing in mentorship programmes for refugee women each year, can help prioritise where to take action.

## Reclassifying efforts as business goals vs social responsibility goals

- Classifying diversity goals as business optimisation targets, instead of corporate social responsibility obligations, will allow companies to make an equitable evaluation of the associated costs and benefits. It will also help to embed refugee hiring and integration as a "normal" part of business planning rather than one-off programmes.
- Set regular benchmarks to track progress, which will also encourage regular check-ins and refining of policies over time.

## Embracing a holistic accounting of costs and benefits

- Develop internal accounting that takes into consideration both direct and indirect costs and benefits of hiring refugee women. Direct benefits include revenue generation, while indirect benefits may include reduced employee turnover, among others. This will allow refugee employees to be evaluated on par with non-refugee employees. Perceptions of risk and cost can often prevent recruitment of refugee women.
- Determine the optimal timeline to evaluate the costs and benefits of refugee recruitment programmes for your company. The cost of hiring refugees could be offset by additional revenue within six months up to a few years. Companies should establish a timeframe to evaluate their investments.

### PROMOTE INCLUSIVE RECRUITMENT:

Companies should promote an inclusive recruiting environment and culture that strives to identify, interview and hire diverse individuals while countering the kind of biases that may even prevent a company from connecting with refugee women. This includes:

## Reviewing job descriptions for potentially alienating language

 Identify the core requirements that you seek for the job rather than publishing a wish-list. Focusing on the specific qualities and skills of the ideal candidate rather than experience and education can cast a wider net. Similarly, being cautious about using description that imply perceived "male" skill sets, such as heavy lifting, and may discourage refugee women from applying.

#### Paying attention to safety and transport needs

- Be clear on the specific requirements for the role. Some roles require early and/or late hours, but this is not always the case. The perception of inflexible work hours may discourage women with caretaking responsibilities from applying.
- When available, provide public transport benefits.
   Understand that the location of your factory or facility may discourage refugee women from participating. Access to safe transport is important, as many refugee workers travel this way. Emphasising the availability of these services will encourage refugee women to participate.

#### Investing in job matching

 Invest up front to find the right candidate by partnering with external recruitment agencies or internally leading the recruitment processes. A randomised control study of Sweden's intensive job matching programme for refugees has shown that refugees that participated had greater labour force participation and retention due to more precise job matching.<sup>88</sup>

#### **Engaging in outreach around hiring**

- Host women-led or women-only events and programming. Some companies have held women-led and women-only "empowerment" roundtables to counter cultural attitudes that discourage women from employment, while others have developed women-only training programmes. These sessions allow companies to directly address refugee women's concerns regarding employment broadly, and can double as an investment in the talent pipeline.
- Some companies have developed and implemented mentorship programmes for refugee women led by their own employees to help job-seeking refugee women enhance their professional networks, interview skills, and resume and cover letters in preparation for entering the job market.
- Use informal channels such as associations, schools, universities and social groups to reach and recruit refugee women.

#### Investing in diverse marketing

- Represent a diversity of voices in job advertisements, including featuring women and refugee women specifically in recruitment ads, to encourage refugee women to see the possibility of working in your company.
- Where possible, engage refugee women who have worked for or are currently working at your company as spokespeople and recruiters for future employees.

## Taking a long-term view on training to counter gender biases

- Invest in pre-employment training. Some refugee women lack the soft skills that come from formal work experience. Developing soft-skills training along with technical skills prior to recruitment, such as through a formal trainee or internship programme, will help identify talent early and set up trainees for future success.
- Use training programmes to negate gendered thinking around certain roles. For instance, IT or warehousing are traditionally perceived to be male jobs. Exposing refugee women trainees to these roles will help remove self-conceived limitations and allow the company to identify the best talent for the job.
- Consider longer training programmes. Longer training periods (e.g. six months) can serve as an effective "interview" mechanism for refugee women and your company. Whether on the job or not, thinking about training as an opportunity to better get to know the candidate over time (an elongated interview) will help identify hidden talents.

#### CONTINUE INVESTING IN REFUGEE WOMEN AFTER RECRUITMENT:

Recruitment is just the beginning of integration. Companies should provide continued support and mentorship to refugee women beyond the hiring and onboarding phase to promote their growth within the company, which also boosts long-term talent development. This includes:

#### Utilising job coaching programmes

• Developing internal coaching programmes that address refugee women's concerns even after

hiring will help to lower attrition and increase employee satisfaction. As newcomers to both your country and company, having a place to go for advice and encouragement will encourage successful long-term integration.

#### **Providing flexible career pathways**

- Recognising that many refugee women are expected to take on childcare roles even if they work, developing career pathways that can accommodate this will encourage female participation.
- Experiment with flexible solutions such as parttime internship programmes until your company finds the right mix.
- Integrate language training into regular training
  schedules. Since a lack of host-country language
  skills is one of the biggest hurdles for refugees,
  incorporating language training specific to
  the sector and job with trainee or internship
  programmes can accelerate integration and help
  refugee workers thrive.

#### WORK WITH EXTERNAL PARTNERS THAT HAVE KNOWLEDGE OF LOCAL CONTEXT FOR REFUGEE WOMEN:

Companies should partner with organisations that are already connected with refugee women to develop a talent pool of candidates, learn best practices on hiring and integrating refugee women, and gain support during the recruitment process. This includes:

## Collaborating with national and local government partners

 Work with national-level refugee integration agencies to take advantage of existing services and tailored training programmes. For instance, these agencies might be able to provide specific training for certain areas of work, such as customer service or warehousing, or training in the host country's official language(s).

- Identify available financial resources that can subsidise additional training or recruitment costs, as well as non-financial support that can provide training for language skills, soft skills and logistical support.
- Utilise local (city or regional level) government agencies. Resources to support recruitment, hiring and integration may be available in your local community. Partner with local agencies to engage in community outreach and awareness building.

#### **Engaging with local and regional organisations**

- Public employment services on the national or local level are good examples of public-private collaborative partners that can provide support to companies and refugee employees.
- Local NGOs and networks often have deep roots within the refugee community and can assist in all levels of career development. This may include:
  - Soft skills training and mentoring
  - Social support such as providing childcare services
  - Countering cultural preconceptions about gender
  - Pre-employment and interview preparations

- Recruitment agencies that have experience working with refugees can be good channels for recruitment.
- EU-wide initiatives such as Employers Together for Integration and the European Alliance for Apprenticeships can offer informational support and guidance on best practices for refugee workforce integration.

#### Leveraging NGOs and informal groups

- Universities and professional groups have established networks of trust that could help your company reach new talent pools. Informal networks can also spread word of recruitment drives and provide encouragement for refugee women applicants.
- Since many refugee women do not have
  access to professional networks, working with
  community centres and similar organisations
  to spread the word of job opportunities can
  provide another channel to refugee women
  talent. Informal networks can also address
  common concerns of refugee women in a safe
  environment. For instance, it might be difficult
  for a female applicant to ask during an interview
  if they are the only woman working at the job, but
  in a safe space like a community centre they may
  feel free to ask.

## FOSTER A MORE INCLUSIVE CORPORATE CULTURE:

Companies can open their doors to refugee women, but it's also important to create an inclusive corporate culture that encourages them to stay. Transforming corporate culture by promoting diversity and inclusion can bring a number of well-documented tangible benefits, including access to new talent pools, enhanced creativity and innovation, stronger retention rates, and revenue generation.

In addition, there are intangible benefits that can spread throughout the company such as reducing discrimination, improving communication in the workplace and creating an environment where different perspectives are valued. Lasting change takes time—and is a continuous process—but there are a number of activities and training that can lead to a more inclusive corporate culture. This includes:

## Raising awareness of the experience of refugees and their cultural backgrounds

- Sharing refugee experiences through workshops, films and training can educate the workforce on the different cultures and experiences of the staff.
- Celebrating diversity by creating moments during which refugees can share details about their cultural and national background, including customs, food, music, art and other cultural characteristics with other employees. This can help coworkers learn about each other and foster an inclusive, open environment.<sup>89</sup>

#### **Being adaptive and flexible**

 Ensure that your company reasonably accommodates different cultural and religious practices. This may include incorporating a more representative set of holiday celebrations that include all employees into the corporate calendar, providing meals in the cafeteria that are sensitive to different cultural dietary requirements and providing a quiet space for prayer.

#### Viewing diversity and inclusion as an integral part of the company's growth strategy

 Diversity and inclusion should be viewed as part of the overall growth and development strategy of a business rather than a "nice-to-have" programme that exists separately from the core operations of the business.



# Conclusion

Future crises and conflicts will inevitably force more people to leave their home countries in search of refuge. Europe, in particular, will continue to welcome a growing number of refugees. Refugee women, who make up a significant proportion of the refugee population, continue to confront a plethora of barriers to employment in their host country.

These challenges range from obstacles like limited professional networks, lacking proficiency in the host country's official language(s), and difficulty validating credentials, which are common among refugees regardless of gender. However, refugee women also face the compounding challenges that are specific to the experience of being a woman and a refugee—such as gender norms from their country of origin that may limit their educational and professional experience, and a high burden of responsibility in the household that deters them from pursuing paid work. The business community can develop hiring practices and workplace policies that are responsive to the needs of refugee women, reduce barriers to employment and promote their integration into the European workforce. Additionally, companies themselves stand to benefit from integrating this group into their core operations as employees. In fact, refugee women represent a high-potential workforce that can help European companies gain a competitive advantage in a global marketplace by filling labour shortages. Additionally, hiring refugee women would allow European companies to get closer to diversity, equity and inclusion goals, which are increasingly important to global consumers. Refugee workers also help companies increase employee retention rates across industries, thus maintaining a stable workforce and paving the path for business growth.

Beyond the business benefits, there are also extensive social benefits to integrating refugee women into a host country's workforce. Refugee women are a fast-growing population in Europe, and ensuring their equitable access to employment will enable them and their families to gain financial stability.



# Annexes

## Annex I: Research methodology

#### Methodology and research approach

Economist Impact conducted extensive desk research, a data scan, and 12 interviews with subject matter experts and business leaders to better understand refugee women's experiences working in Europe, identify barriers to employment, and uncover opportunities to promote greater equity in recruitment processes for refugee women. Interviews were conducted from April 2021 through June 2021.

The research focuses on five major European host countries (France, Germany, Sweden, Switzerland and the UK), which have absorbed a large portion of refugees since the 2015 European migration crisis.

The report also includes case studies of four companies that are working to incorporate more refugee women employees. The case studies analyse the key barriers and opportunities that these companies have faced and list some of the strategies and interventions that, according to the interviewees, have contributed to positive business outcomes for their companies. Alongside desk research, the case studies inform a set of recommendations for European companies to improve labour market inclusion among refugee women in host countries.

#### Limitations

Comparable data availability remains a major limitation, thus it is challenging to make generalisations and/or cross-country comparisons among refugee women in Europe. For instance, time-series data are rarely available, and looking at a single point in time does not offer the full picture, especially as refugees are likely to acquire language proficiency, receive professional and academic training, and join the labour force the longer they stay in the host country.

In some cases, data collected are from before the 2015 European refugee crisis, which makes it difficult to compare with subsequent waves of refugee arrivals. Moreover, each of the host countries compile refugee statistics differently. For example, Switzerland provides a disaggregation of refugees by type of work/residence permit, while a refugee falls under the category of "asylum migrants" in the UK. Lastly, this report focuses mainly on the perspective of business leaders and further research is needed to better understand the perspective of refugee women in the labour market.

## Annex II: Works cited

adidas. "Income Statement." *adidas Annual Report 2020*, adidas, 2020, <u>https://report.</u> adidas-group.com/2020/en/group-management-report-financial-review/businessperformance/income-statement.html

adidas. "Sustainability - Employees." adidas, w<u>ww.adidas-group.com/en/sustainability/</u>people/employees/#/

Albrecht, Clara, et al. "The Integration Challenges of Female Refugees and Migrants: Where Do We Stand?" *CESifo* Forum, vol. 22, no. 2, 2021, pp. 38-46, <u>www.cesifo.org/en/</u> publikationen/2021/article-journal/integration-challenges-female-refugees-and-migrantswhere-do-we

Angelo, Paul J. "Top Conflicts to Watch in 2021: Economic, Political, and Humanitarian Catastrophe in Venezuela." Council on Foreign Relations, 22 January 2021, <u>www.cfr.org/</u> blog/top-conflicts-watch-2021-economic-political-and-humanitarian-catastrophevenezuela

Baic, Alexander, et al. "How 300 Companies Integrated 2,500 Refugees into Germany's Labor Market." *BCG*, 30 May 2017, <u>www.bcg.com/publications/2017/social-impact-employment-</u> companies-integrated-refugees-germany-labor-market

Ballais , J, et al. "The Place of the French Language in Arabic-Speaking Mediterranean." Handbook of the Changing World Language Map, Springer, 17 July 2018, <u>https://doi.</u> org/10.1007/978-3-319-73400-2\_8-1

Brücker, Herbert, et. al. "Fünf Jahre seit der Fluchtmigration 2015: Integration in Arbeitsmarkt und Bildungssystem macht weitere Fortschritte." Institute for Employment Research, no. 4, 2020, www.iab.de/en/publikationen/kurzbericht/publikationendetails-kurzbericht.aspx/ Publikation/k200129301

"Case Study: Volkswagen's Hiring and Training Initiatives for Refugees in Germany." YouTube, uploaded by Tent Partnership for Refugees, 18 March 2021, <u>www.youtube.com/</u> watch?v=eg3kXb6lvj4&t=820s

Christophersen, Eirik. "These 10 countries receive the most refugees." Norwegian Refugee Council, 01 November 2021, <u>www.nrc.no/perspectives/2020/the-10-countries-that-</u> receive-the-most-refugees/

Dumont, Jean-Christophe, et al. "How are refugees faring on the labour market in Europe?" OECD, 22 September 2016, <u>www.ec.europa.eu/migrant-integration/librarydoc/how-are-</u> refugees-faring-on-the-labour-market-in-europe Erdem, Tülin, et. al. "How Helping Refugees Helps Brands: An Analysis of French, German, and Italian Consumer Perceptions." Tent Partnership for Refugees, June 2019, <u>www.tent.org/</u> resources/helping-refugees-helps-brands-europe/

European Commission. "Reforming the Common European Asylum System." European Commission, 13 July 2016, <u>https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/</u> MEMO\_16\_2436

Eurostat. "Asylum applicants by type of applicant, citizenship, age and sex - monthly data (rounded)." Eurostat, 28 September 2021, https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/databrowser/view/ MIGR\_ASYAPPCTZM\_\_custom\_1346408/default/line?lang=en

Eurostat, "Employment and unemployment (Labor force survey)." Eurostat, <u>https://ec.europa.</u> eu/eurostat/web/lfs/data/database

Eurostat. "Gender pay gap statistics." *Eurostat*, February 2021, <u>https://ec.europa.eu/</u> eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php?title=Gender\_pay\_gap\_statistics

Eurostat. "Population by Educational Attainment Level, Sex, Age and Country of Birth (%)." Eurostat Data Explorer, Eurostat, 13 October 2021, <u>http://appsso.eurostat.ec.europa.eu/nui/</u> show.do?dataset=edat\_lfs\_9912

Forbes. "IKEA." Forbes, 2021, www.forbes.com/companies/ikea/?sh=21f9e6e32ad0

Forbes. "Staples (SPLS)." *Forbes*, 23 November 2020, <u>https://www.forbes.com/companies/</u> staples/?list=largest-private-companies&sh=70f7fecdce9b

German Federal Statistical Office. "Persons seeking protection by protection status and reference year." German Federal Statistical Office, 14 July 2021, https://www.destatis.de/EN/ Themes/Society-Environment/Population/Migration-Integration/Tables/protection-timeseries-protections-status.html;jsessionid=A456C94B35ACBF9B0EC89A9AEB5DD73C. live711

Guéhenno, Jean-Marie. "Conflict Is Key to Understanding Migration." Carnegie Europe, 13 May 2016, www.carnegieeurope.eu/strategiceurope/?fa=63578

Heisig, Jan Paul. "Measuring the signaling value of educational degrees: secondary education systems and the internal homogeneity of educational groups." *Large-Scale Assessment in Education*, vol. 6, no. 9, 4 September 2018, https:// largescaleassessmentsineducation.springeropen.com/articles/10.1186/s40536-018-0062-1 Helgesson, Petter, et al. "'Equal Entry' to the Swedish labour market for migrant women." Arbetsförmedlingen, 8 December 2020, <u>www.arbetsformedlingen.se/</u> download/18.7887697f1763d9e8096762/1607608859722/af-analys-can-jsa-increaseemployment-for-newly-arrived-immigrant-women.pdf

Hogarth, Terence. "COVID-19 and the Demand for Labor and Skills in Europe: Early Evidence and Implications for Migration Policy." Migration Policy Institute, February 2021, <u>www.</u> migrationpolicy.org/research/covid-19-labor-skills-europe-migration-policy

Kallick, David Dyssegaard, and Roldan, Cyierra. "Refugees As Employees: Good Retention, Strong Recruitment." Tent Partnership for Refugees, May 2018, <u>www.tent.org/resources/</u> good-retention-strong-recruitment/

Kiss, Monika. "The future of work: Trends, challenges and potential initiatives." European Parliament Think Tank, 15 February 2021, <u>www.europarl.europa.eu/thinktank/en/document</u>. html?reference=EPRS\_BRI(2021)679097

Klugman, Jeni, and Kabir, Raiyan. "Unlocking Refugee Women's Potential." Georgetown Institute for Women, Peace and Security, July 2019, <u>www.giwps.georgetown.edu/resource/</u> unlocking-refugee-womens-potential/

Kone, Zovanga, et. al. "Refugees and the UK labor market." European Commission, 25 April 2019, <u>www.ec.europa.eu/migrant-integration/librarydoc/refugees-and-the-uk-labour-market</u>

Kosyakova, Yuliya, et al. "Arbeitsmarktintegration in Deutschland: Geflüchtete Frauen Müssen Viele Hindernisse Überwinden." IAB, IAB-Kurzbericht, 08/2021, 14 April 2021, https://www.iab.de/en/publikationen/kurzbericht/publikationendetails-kurzbericht.aspx/ Publikation/K210409IYX

Liebig, Thomas, and Tronstad, Kristian Rose "Triple Disadvantage?: A first overview of the integration of refugee women.", *OECD*, 30 August 2018, <u>www.doi.org/10.1787/3f3a9612-en</u>

Loo, Bryce. "Recognizing refugee qualifications: practical tips for credential Assessment." World Education Services, May 2016, www.glotalent.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/ Recognizing-Refugee-Credentials-Pratical-Tips-for-Credential-Assessment.pdf

Macias, Amanda. "U.S. winds down Kabul mission after helping evacuate 116,000 people in just over 2 weeks." CNBC, 30 August 2021, <u>https://www.cnbc.com/2021/08/30/afghanistan-update-us-winds-down-mission-over-116000-people-evacuated-since-aug-14.html</u>

Ministère de l'Intérieur (France). "Refugees' First Years in France after Receiving Their First Residence Permit." Ministère de l'Intérieur, December 2015, <u>https://www.immigration.</u> interieur.gouv.fr/Info-ressources/Etudes-et-statistiques/Etudes/Etudes/Infosmigrations#Num%C3%A9ros%20parus%20en%202015, Infos migrations n°80-81

OECD, and UNHCR. "Engaging with employers in the hiring of refugees: A 10-point multistakeholder action plan for employers, refugees, governments and civil society." UNHCR, 2018 www.unhcr.org/en-us/protection/livelihoods/5adde9904/engaging-employers-hiringrefugees-10-point-multi-stakeholder-action-plan.html

OECD. "Working hours needed to exit poverty." OECD, 2021, <u>www.data.oecd.org/benwage/</u> working-hours-needed-to-exit-poverty.htm

Park, Jeanne. "Europe's Migration Crisis." Council on Foreign Relations, 23 September 2015, https://www.cfr.org/backgrounder/europes-migration-crisis

Podesta, John. "The Climate Crisis, Migration, and Refugees." Brookings, 25 July 2021, <u>www.</u> brookings.edu/research/the-climate-crisis-migration-and-refugees/

Schmid-Drüner, Marion. "Asylum Policy: Fact Sheets on the European Union: European Parliament." Fact Sheets on the European Union | European Parliament, European Parliament , April 2021, https://www.europarl.europa.eu/factsheets/en/sheet/151/asylum-policy

Smit, Sven, et. al. "The future of work in Europe." McKinsey Global Institute, 10 June 2020, www.mckinsey.com/featured-insights/future-of-work/the-future-of-work-in-europe

Statistics Sweden, "Labour force surveys – Theme: The labour market situation for refugees and refugee family members 2010–2018." Statistics Sweden, 03 May 2019, www.scb.se/en/ finding-statistics/statistics-by-subject-area/labour-market/labour-force-surveys/labourforce-surveys-lfs/pong/publications/labour-force-surveys--theme-the-labour-marketsituation-for-refugees-and-refugee-family-members-20102018/

UNHCR. "Global Report 2015." UNHCR, 2015, www.reporting.unhcr.org/node/15701

UNHCR. "Integration handbook." UNHCR, https://www.unhcr.org/handbooks/ih/ employment-training/employment

UNHCR. "Mediterranean situation." UNHCR, 2021, <u>www.data2.unhcr.org/en/situations/</u> mediterranean

UNHCR. "Refugee Statistics." UNHCR, www.unhcr.org/refugee-statistics/download/

UN Women. "Women and Armed Conflict." UN Women | The Beijing Platform for Action Turns 20, www.beijing20.unwomen.org/en/in-focus/armed-conflict

Von Der Burchard, Hans. "EU plans big cash offer for Afghanistan's neighbors to host refugees." Politico, 31 August 2021, <u>www.politico.eu/article/eu-plans-afghanistan-neighbors-host-refugees/</u>

Weber, Tina, and Adăscăliței, Dragoș. "Tackling labour shortages in EU Member States." Eurofound, 20 July 2021, <u>www.eurofound.europa.eu/publications/report/2021/tackling-</u>labour-shortages-in-eu-member-states

World Bank. "Employment in Services, Female (% of Female Employment) (Modeled ILO Estimate) - European Union." *World Bank*, WB, 29 January 2021, <u>https://data.worldbank.org/</u> indicator/SL.SRV.EMPL.FE.ZS?locations=EU

World Bank. "World Development Indicators." The World Bank, 2021, <u>www.datatopics.</u> worldbank.org/world-development-indicators/

World Population Review. "What Languages Do People Speak in Afghanistan?" *World Population Review*, 2021, https://worldpopulationreview.com/languages/afghanistan

World Value Survey. "World Value Survey Wave 7: 2017-2020." World Value Survey, 2020, www.worldvaluessurvey.org/WVSOnline.jsp

EMPLOYMENT AND INTEGRATION IN EUROPE | HOW BUSINESSES CAN HIRE REFUGEE WOMEN AND GAIN A TALENTED WORKFORCE

## **Endnotes**

- 1 EU27, Switzerland and the UK
- 2 Percentages are rounded to the nearest whole number throughout this report.
- 3 In 2015-20, average population growth in EU countries was about 0.15% per year. World Bank. "World Development Indicators." The World Bank, 2021, www.datatopics.worldbank.org/world-development-indicators/
- 4 https://www.unhcr.org/en-us/what-is-a-refugee.html
- 5 European Commission. "Reforming the Common European Asylum System." European Commission, 13 July 2016, <u>https://ec.europa.</u> eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/MEMO\_16\_2436.
- 6 Schmid-Drüner, Marion. "Asylum Policy: Fact Sheets on the European Union: European Parliament." Fact Sheets on the European Union | European Parliament, European Parliament, April 2021, https://www.europarl.europa.eu/factsheets/en/sheet/151/asylum-policy.
- 7 Garrett, Amanda. "The Refugee Crisis, Brexit, and the Reframing of Immigration in Britain." Council for European Studies (CES), Council for European Studies (CES), 9 Sept. 2019, https://www.europenowjournal.org/2019/09/09/the-refugee-crisis-brexit-and-the-reframing-of-immigration-in-britain/
- 8 Park, Jeanne. "Europe's Migration Crisis." Council on Foreign Relations, 23 September 2015, <u>https://www.cfr.org/backgrounder/</u> europes-migration-crisis
- 9 UNHCR. "Mediterranean situation." UNHCR, 2021, data2.unhcr.org/en/situations/mediterranean
- 10 Guéhenno, Jean-Marie. "Conflict Is Key to Understanding Migration." Carnegie Europe, 13 May 2016, www.carnegieeurope.eu/ strategiceurope/?fa=63578
- 11 Angelo, Paul J. "Top Conflicts to Watch in 2021: Economic, Political, and Humanitarian Catastrophe in Venezuela." Council on Foreign Relations, 22 January 2021, www.cfr.org/blog/top-conflicts-watch-2021-economic-political-and-humanitarian-catastrophevenezuela
- 12 Podesta, John. "The Climate Crisis, Migration, and Refugees." Brookings, 25 July 2021, <u>www.brookings.edu/research/the-climate-crisis-migration-and-refugees/</u>
- 13 Maizland, Lindsay. "Where Will Afghan Refugees Go?" Council on Foreign Relations, Council on Foreign Relations, 8 September 2021, https://www.cfr.org/in-brief/where-will-afghan-refugees-go.
- 14 Asylum applications in Europe reached a historical high of 33,865 since 2008, when data were first available. Eurostat. "Asylum applicants by type of applicant, citizenship, age and sex monthly data (rounded)." Eurostat, 28 September 2021, https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/databrowser/view/MIGR\_ASYAPPCTZM\_custom\_1346408/default/line?lang=en
- 15 122,300 individuals, including 5,500 US citizens and their families, were evacuated from end-July to end-August . Macias, Amanda. "U.S. winds down Kabul mission after helping evacuate 116,000 people in just over 2 weeks." CNBC, 30 August 2021, <u>https://www.cnbc.</u> com/2021/08/30/afghanistan-update-us-winds-down-mission-over-116000-people-evacuated-since-aug-14.html
- 16 Maizland, Lindsay. "Where Will Afghan Refugees Go?", Council on Foreign Relations, 8 Sep. 2021, <u>https://www.cfr.org/in-brief/where-</u> will-afghan-refugees-go.

- 17 Although the UK has pledged to resettle another 15,000 refugees, the timeline for this resettlement has not been announced by the country. Human Rights Watch. "Europe: Lead Efforts to Protect at-Risk Afghans." Human Rights Watch, 24 Aug. 2021, <u>https://www.hrw.org/news/2021/08/24/europe-lead-efforts-protect-risk-afghans</u>.
- 18 Norman, Laurence. "EU Offers No New Pledges to Take in Afghan Refugees." The Wall Street Journal, Dow Jones & Company, 7 Oct. 2021, https://www.wsj.com/articles/eu-offers-no-new-pledges-to-take-in-afghan-refugees-11633624363.
- 19 UN Women. "Women and Armed Conflict." UN Women | The Beijing Platform for Action Turns 20, <u>www.beijing20.unwomen.org/en/in-</u> focus/armed-conflict
- 20 During 2019, 36% of refugees in both Germany and France were women. In fact, gender disaggregated data for France are not available for 2020, and we instead use the year of 2019 as a proxy for both countries. Nonetheless, the 2019 figure remains an approximation owing to a data gap for France, whereby 100,860 refugees remained unclassified by gender.
- 21 Dumont, Jean-Christophe, et al. "How are refugees faring on the labour market in Europe?" OECD, 22 September 2016, <u>www.ec.europa.</u> eu/migrant-integration/librarydoc/how-are-refugees-faring-on-the-labour-market-in-europe
- 22 The EU Labour Force Survey (EU-LFS) is conducted across all member states of the European Union, four EU candidate countries and three countries who are part of the European Free Trade Association. In addition to collecting the core variables of the LFS, each year the household survey also collects information on a specific ad-hoc module determined for the year. Data on the labour market situation for refugees were first collected in 2008 and then in 2014 under the "Labour market situation of migrants and their immediate descendants" module. The 2021 LFS, which would be the latest survey on this module, is currently under way and the results are yet to be released. Eurostat. "EU Labour Force Survey - Modules." Eurostat, 2021, <u>https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.</u> php?title=EU\_labour\_force\_survey\_-\_modules&oldid=516201.
- 23 Ministre de l'intérieur. "Refugees' First Years in France after Receiving Their First Residence Permit." Ministre De L'intérieur, Dec. 2015, https://www.immigration.interieur.gouv.fr/Info-ressources/Etudes-et-statistiques/Etudes/Infosmigrations#Num%C3%A9ros%20parus%20en%202015.Infos migrations n°80-81
- 24 Kosyakova, Yuliya, et al. "Arbeitsmarktintegration in Deutschland: Geflüchtete Frauen Müssen Viele Hindernisse Überwinden." IAB, IAB-Kurzbericht, 08/2021, 14 April 2021, https://www.iab.de/en/publikationen/kurzbericht/publikationendetails-kurzbericht.aspx/ Publikation/K210409IYX.
- 25 The survey looked at refugees who arrived in Germany since 2013, which seem to constitute the majority of refugees in Germany. In fact, the total number of refugees was only 187,545 in 2013, increasing to 1.2 million in 2020 (Source: UNHCR). According to the German Central Registry of Foreigners, the total number of persons seeking asylum, including those granted refugee status, amounted to 1.86 million as of end-2020.
- 26 Kiss, Monika. "The future of work: Trends, challenges and potential initiatives." European Parliament Think Tank, 15 February 2021, www.europarl.europa.eu/thinktank/en/document.html?reference=EPRS\_BRI(2021)679097
- 27 Smit, Sven, et. al. "The future of work in Europe." McKinsey Global Institute, 10 June 2020, https://www.mckinsey.com/~/media/ mckinsey/featured%20insights/future%20of%20organizations/the%20future%20of%20work%20in%20europe/mgi-the-future-ofwork-in-europe-discussion-paper.pdf
- 28 Kiss, Monika. "The future of work: Trends, challenges and potential initiatives." European Parliament Think Tank, 15 February 2021, www.europarl.europa.eu/thinktank/en/document.html?reference=EPRS\_BRI(2021)679097

- 29 Weber, Tina, and Adăscăliței, Dragoș. "Tackling labour shortages in EU Member States." Eurofound, 20 July 2021, <u>www.eurofound.</u> europa.eu/publications/report/2021/tackling-labour-shortages-in-eu-member-states
- 30 World Bank. "Employment in Services, Female (% of Female Employment) (Modeled ILO Estimate) European Union." World Bank, WB, 29 Jan. 2021, https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.SRV.EMPL.FE.ZS?locations=EU.
- 31 Hogarth, Terence. "COVID-19 and the Demand for Labor and Skills in Europe: Early Evidence and Implications for Migration Policy." Migration Policy Institute, Feb. 2021, www.migrationpolicy.org/research/covid-19-labor-skills-europe-migration-policy
- 32 Weber, Tina, and Adăscăliței, Dragoș. "Tackling labour shortages in EU Member States." Eurofound, 20 July 2021, <u>www.eurofound.</u> europa.eu/publications/report/2021/tackling-labour-shortages-in-eu-member-states
- 33 Ibid.
- 34 Interview conducted with IKEA.
- 35 In the UK, Starbucks is hiring refugees for entry-level jobs, while professional services companies such as PwC and EY are helping highly skilled refugee professionals gain access to the labour market at a level commensurate with their experience. Technology companies such as Amazon, PayPal and Coursera are also actively recruiting and hiring refugee women. Interviews with several NGOs.
- 36 Interview conducted with an NGO.
- 37 Erdem, Tülin, et. al. "How Helping Refugees Helps Brands: An Analysis of French, German, and Italian Consumer Perceptions." Tent Partnership for Refugees, June 2019, www.tent.org/resources/helping-refugees-helps-brands-europe/
- 38 Interview conducted with an NGO.
- 39 Data were confidentially provided by four manufacturing firms.
- 40 Kallick, David Dyssegaard, and Roldan, Cyierra. "Refugees As Employees: Good Retention, Strong Recruitment." Tent Partnership for Refugees, May 2018, www.tent.org/resources/good-retention-strong-recruitment/
- 41 Klugman, Jeni, and Kabir, Raiyan. "Unlocking Refugee Women's Potential." Georgetown Institute for Women, Peace and Security, July 2019, www.giwps.georgetown.edu/resource/unlocking-refugee-womens-potential/
- 42 Liebig, Thomas, and Tronstad, Kristian Rose "Triple Disadvantage?: A first overview of the integration of refugee women.", OECD, 30 August 2018, www.doi.org/10.1787/3f3a9612-en
- 43 Refugee women from different countries of origin bring different levels of human capital and skill sets: for instance, adult female (15+) literacy rates are much higher for Iraq and Syria versus Afghanistan (80% and 74% vs. 30%). School enrollment also differs widely—99% of Iraqi girls complete school-based primary education while only 83% of Afghani girls do so. At the higher education levels—only 5% of Afghani women and 12% of Iraqi women have complete tertiary education, while in Syria 43% of women have enrolled in college or similar.
- 44 According to UNESCO's International Standard Classification of Education (ISCED), upper secondary education or above is represented by ISCED 3-8 codes.
- 45 Dumont, Jean-Christophe, et al. "How are refugees faring on the labour market in Europe?" OECD, 22 September 2016, <u>www.ec.europa.</u> eu/migrant-integration/librarydoc/how-are-refugees-faring-on-the-labour-market-in-europe

- 46 Eurostat. "Population by Educational Attainment Level, Sex, Age and Country of Birth (%)." Eurostat Data Explorer, Eurostat, 13 Oct. 2021, http://appsso.eurostat.ec.europa.eu/nui/show.do?dataset=edat\_lfs\_9912.
- 47 A low level of education is represented by ISCED 0-2 codes.
- 48 A high level of education is represented by ISCED 5-8 codes.
- 49 Dumont, Jean-Christophe, et al. "How are refugees faring on the labour market in Europe?" OECD, 22 September 2016, <u>www.ec.europa.</u> eu/migrant-integration/librarydoc/how-are-refugees-faring-on-the-labour-market-in-europe
- 50 As of 2011, 35% of Iraq's population spoke English. Euromonitor International. "The Benefits of the English Language for Individuals and Societies: Quantitative Indicators from Algeria, Egypt, Iraq, Jordan, Lebanon, Morocco, Tunisia and Yemen." Euromonitor International, Apr. 2012, https://www.teachingenglish.org.uk/sites/teacheng/files/Euromonitor%20report%20final%20July%202012. pdf. p. 226
- 51 World Population Review. "What Languages Do People Speak in Afghanistan?" World Population Review, 2021, <u>https://</u>worldpopulationreview.com/languages/afghanistan.
- 52 Ballais, J, et al. "The Place of the French Language in the Arabic-Speaking Mediterranean." Handbook of the Changing World Language Map, Springer, 17 July 2018, https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-73400-2\_8-1. pp 1-13.
- 53 Dumont, Jean-Christophe, et al. "How are refugees faring on the labour market in Europe?" OECD, 22 September 2016, <u>www.ec.europa.</u> eu/migrant-integration/librarydoc/how-are-refugees-faring-on-the-labour-market-in-europe
- 54 Liebig, Thomas, and Tronstad, Kristian Rose "Triple Disadvantage?: A first overview of the integration of refugee women.", OECD, 30 August 2018, www.doi.org/10.1787/3f3a9612-en
- 55 Albrecht, Clara, et al. "The Integration Challenges of Female Refugees and Migrants: Where Do We Stand?" CESifo Forum, vol. 22, no. 2, 2021, pp. 38-46, www.cesifo.org/en/publikationen/2021/article-journal/integration-challenges-female-refugees-and-migrantswhere-do-we
- 56 Data were not available for Afghanistan, Eritrea and Syria.
- 57 Liebig, Thomas, and Tronstad, Kristian Rose "Triple Disadvantage?: A first overview of the integration of refugee women.", OECD, 30 August 2018, www.doi.org/10.1787/3f3a9612-en
- 58 Ibid.
- 59 UNHCR. "Employment." UNHCR Integration Handbook, https://www.unhcr.org/handbooks/ih/employment-training/employment.
- 60 Refugees make up a subset of a larger group of "displaced people without verifiable documentation" in Europe for the purpose of qualification verification.
- 61 Loo, Bryce. "Recognizing refugee qualifications: practical tips for credential Assessment." World Education Services, May 2016, www. glotalent.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/Recognizing-Refugee-Credentials-Pratical-Tips-for-Credential-Assessment.pdf

- 62 Ibid.
- 63 According to one of our interviews.
- 64 Eurostat. "Gender pay gap statistics." Eurostat, February 2021 <u>https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.</u> php?title=Gender\_pay\_gap\_statistics
- 65 Klugman, Jeni, and Kabir, Raiyan. "Unlocking Refugee Women's Potential." Georgetown Institute for Women, Peace and Security, July 2019, www.giwps.georgetown.edu/resource/unlocking-refugee-womens-potential/
- 66 Survey was conducted in March 2017.
- 67 Note: not all countries in Europe offer government subsidies for hiring refugees.
- 68 Baic, Alexander, et al. "How 300 Companies Integrated 2,500 Refugees into Germany's Labor Market." BCG, 30 May 2017, <u>www.bcg</u>. com/publications/2017/social-impact-employment-companies-integrated-refugees-germany-labor-market
- 69 Kremer Machine System is a specialist in industrial assembly.
- 70 Job search assistance programmes provide more intensive assistance than other available programmes by supporting job seekers via career guidance, coaching and professional development courses. By contrast, other programmes only provide direct support to match job seekers to existing vacancies.
- 71 More specifically, these include newly arrived immigrants who have received residence permits as refugees or are in need of protection, as well as their families.
- 72 Helgesson, Petter, et al. "Equal Entry' to the Swedish labour market for migrant women." Arbetsförmedlingen, 8 December 2020, www. arbetsformedlingen.se/download/18.7887697f1763d9e8096762/1607608859722/af-analys-can-jsa-increase-employment-fornewly-arrived-immigrant-women.pdf
- 73 Baic, Alexander, et al. (2017).
- 74 Heisig, Jan Paul. "Measuring the signaling value of educational degrees: secondary education systems and the internal homogeneity of educational groups." Large-Scale Assessment in Education, vol. 6, no. 9, 4 September 2018, <u>https://</u> largescaleassessmentsineducation.springeropen.com/articles/10.1186/s40536-018-0062-1
- 75 "Case Study: Volkswagen's Hiring and Training Initiatives for Refugees in Germany." YouTube, uploaded by Tent Partnership for Refugees, 18 March 2021, www.youtube.com/watch?v=eg3kXb6lvj4&t=820s
- 76 Interviews with several NGOs.
- 77 Note: H&M suppliers operated this training programme for refugee women in Turkey.
- 78 Liebig, Thomas, and Tronstad, Kristian Rose "Triple Disadvantage?: A first overview of the integration of refugee women.", OECD, 30 August 2018, www.doi.org/10.1787/3f3a9612-en
- 79 For more information on the survey methodology, please refer to the following website: <a href="https://fdz.iab.de/en/FDZ\_Individual\_Data/iab-bamf-soep.aspx">https://fdz.iab.de/en/FDZ\_Individual\_Data/iab-bamf-soep.aspx</a>

- 80 Brücker, Herbert, et al. "IAB-BAMF-SOEP-Befragung Von Geflüchteten: Überblick Und Erste Ergebnisse ." Bundesamt Für Migration Und Flüchtlinge, Bundesamt Für Migration Und Flüchtlinge, 15 Nov. 2016, https://www.bamf.de/SharedDocs/Anlagen/DE/Forschung/ Forschungsberichte/fb29-iab-bamf-soep-befragung-gefluechtete.pdf;jsessionid=9FEDA2EDE68271755E4D38158A97A14F. intranet252?\_\_blob=publicationFile&v=15. Forschungsbericht 29
- 81 Two adults and two children.
- 82 Brücker, Herbert, et al. "IAB-BAMF-SOEP-Befragung Von Geflüchteten: Überblick Und Erste Ergebnisse ." Bundesamt Für Migration Und Flüchtlinge, Bundesamt Für Migration Und Flüchtlinge, 15 Nov. 2016, https://www.bamf.de/SharedDocs/Anlagen/DE/Forschung/ Forschungsberichte/fb29-iab-bamf-soep-befragung-gefluechtete.pdf;jsessionid=9FEDA2EDE68271755E4D38158A97A14F. intranet252?\_\_blob=publicationFile&v=15. Forschungsbericht 29
- 83 "Case Study: Volkswagen's Hiring and Training Initiatives for Refugees in Germany." YouTube, uploaded by Tent Partnership for Refugees, 18 March 2021, www.youtube.com/watch?v=eg3kXb6lvj4&t=820s
- 84 Christophersen, Eirik. "These 10 Countries Receive the Most Refugees." Norwegian Refugee Council, NRC, Nov. 2020, https://www.nrc. no/perspectives/2020/the-10-countries-that-receive-the-most-refugees/.
- 85 Forbes. "IKEA." Forbes, 12 Oct. 2021, https://www.forbes.com/companies/ikea/.
- 86 adidas. "Income Statement." *adidas Annual Report 2020*, adidas, 2020, <u>https://report.adidas-group.com/2020/en/group-management-</u>report-financial-review/business-performance/income-statement.html.
- 87 Forbes. "Staples (SPLS)." Forbes, 23 November 2020, https://www.forbes.com/companies/staples/?list=largest-privatecompanies&sh=70f7fecdce9b.
- 88 Helgesson, Petter, et al. "Equal Entry' to the Swedish labour market for migrant women." Arbetsförmedlingen, 8 December 2020, www. arbetsformedlingen.se/download/18.7887697f1763d9e8096762/1607608859722/af-analys-can-jsa-increase-employment-fornewly-arrived-immigrant-women.pdf
- 89 Katie Reynolds. "5 Strategies for Promoting Diversity in the Workplace, Hult International Business School" Hult International Business School Blog. 2017. https://www.hult.edu/blog/promoting-diversity-in-workplace/



Written by

